Assignment 7 Summary

Peng Shao

NOTE: a detailed summary can be found on pages 2-4.

What people tended to agree on ... most were intrigued by the concept of **externalizations** in collaborative design. Many were also interested in the idea of **open systems.** Furthermore, most agreed that many consumers are **not interested in designing** because of the lack of perceived benefit.

What people tended to disagree on ... curiously people had different thoughts about technical challenges. Brian Sax said it was **difficult to implement** the "seed" idea, whereas Yingdan noted that we are more **limited by our creative capacity**. Also, perhaps ironically, while most people agreed on what was "Most Interesting" (question #2) they tended to disagree on what was "Interesting" (Question #5). Brian Sax thought the implementation of the EDC structure was flexible, while Brian Brown insisted that the system did not appear very flexible at all!

Most interesting response (aka. most rebellious?) ... Praful Mangalath downright questions the practicality of a system like EDC. He suggests that many consumers are OK being stuck behind the SKIP during their daily commute. Praful is not sure that the EDC addresses collaboration issues found in the real world and found little evidence supporting the usefulness of EDC based on preliminary web searches.

Detailed summary can be found on pages 2-4. Comments of interest shaded in yellow.

| Author | Main Message | Most Interesting | Tech Challenges | Social Challenges | Experience | Interesting | Innovative | Outdated | Inappr. |
|---------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|---------|
| Brian Sax | * only way to solve complex design problems through collaboration. * possible to combine multiple viewpoints into one solution. * understand limiting factors of HCI. | * externalizations in collaborative design. * intrigued by open systems idea. | * too hard to implement "seed" idea from the paper. | * impossible to convert every consumer into designer. | * participation limited to those who feel strongly about issue. | * flexible implementation. * support for dynamic problems and collaboration essential to design. | | Outdated | шаррі. |
| Yingdan Huang | * EDC attempts to solve some HCI problems. * emphasis on human factors on top of technical. | * symmetry of ignorance. * externalizations. | * we are limited by our imagination, discovery, envisionment more than implementation (development). | * eclecticism - aesthetic issues in specific domains. | * architect - if the clients insist on a bad design, we had nothing to do about it. | * likes the "form" and "function" of EDC. | * EDC only table surface board she has seen for "serious" research. | | |
| Davis / Lavallee | * illuminate obstructions that limit admancements in future HCI and find solutions through the EDC. | * software systems should be able to adapt to different specs over the course of deployment. * user interaction is crucial. | * simultaneous interaction. eg. with a computer screen only one person can interact at a time. * how to incorporate consumers into the design. | * most consumers are just interested in the final product and not development. | * engine management tuner - the system incorporated specs from the user. | | * allows multiple users access simultaneously. | * suggests an all-digital system. | |

| Jason Held | * solving problems in HCI with the EDC. * leveraging "symmetry of ignorance". | externalization, esp. with regards to collaboration. * simultaneous access. * informed participation leads to ownership. | * such a system would be very complex and large. | * how to get the community involved? | examples: * online communities. * Wikipedia. | * a system that may help solve issues of collaborative design. * sense of community through stakeholders. | | |
|------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|--|
| Speir / Zeles | * focus on process of designing. * designing software envs with the user in mind. * contextualizing obtained information. | * "two minds are better than one". | * versioning issues. * control management. * technical discrepancies of sharing the environment. | * disagreements, not getting along. | * Online Question- Answer forums. | * simultaneous access. | * needs improvements on ease-of- use. | |

| Praful Mangalath | * rethink the role of computational media and devices in broader complex contexts. * EDC transcends the basic assumptions of HCI. | * transcending the individual human mind. | | * is "collaborative-design" and "participation" a necessary problem in the first place? * most people are satisfied with just having a "bus route" and are ok with being stuck behind the SKIP during their commute. | * not sure the EDC solves actual collaboration problems in the real world. | * perhaps this project needs to adopt some principles from the "One Laptop per Child program" which aims at practical largescale adoption. | | | * subscribing to the objectivist manifesto can be a rewarding and productive experience. * found little practical evidence for the usefulness of the EDC tools. |
|---------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Brian Brown | * transcending the individual working in isolation. | externalizations - esp. how they can be automatically created. * storing the information generated while working in the EDC. * open systems - potentially a meta language. | * domain extensibility. | * must be easy to use. * users must perceive a sufficient benefit from contributing. | * "town hall meetings" - people have discourse but do not feel they have much impact on the ultimate decisions. | | * the use of multiple displays to show different representations of current data. | * action space looks outdated and inflexible. * not portable. | |

This document was created with Win2PDF available at http://www.win2pdf.com. The unregistered version of Win2PDF is for evaluation or non-commercial use only. This page will not be added after purchasing Win2PDF.